

**MINUTES OF THE
NEW YORK STATE ENERGY PLANNING BOARD MEETING
HELD ON MAY 6, 2008**

Pursuant to notice dated May 2, 2008, the first meeting of the New York State Energy Planning Board (“Energy Planning Board”) was convened on May 6, 2008 at 2:30 p.m. in Room 250 of the State Capitol Building in Albany, New York, and was webcast.

The following Energy Planning Board Members (or designees) were present:

Paul A. DeCotis, Deputy Secretary for Energy and Chairman of the Energy Planning Board

Judith Enck, Deputy Secretary for the Environment, participated by teleconference.

Garry A. Brown, Chairman of the New York State Public Service Commission

Robert G. Callender, Vice President for Programs of the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority

Lorraine Cortes-Vasquez, Secretary of State

Richard Daines, Commissioner of the New York State Department of Health

Astrid C. Glynn, Commissioner of the New York State Department of Transportation

Alexander “Pete” Grannis, Commissioner of the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

Nancy Reuss, designee of Laura L. Anglin, Director of the New York State Division of Budget

Kristen Heath, designee of Dan Gundersen, Commissioner of the New York State Department of Economic Development

Thomas C.C. Congdon, Executive Director of the Energy Planning Board, Hal Brodie, Counsel to the Energy Planning Board, and Jacquelyn L. Jerry, acting secretary were also present. In addition, the meeting was attended by a number of persons from the public and private sectors.

Chairman DeCotis called the meeting to order. He explained that, although the Open Meetings Law did not apply to the Energy Planning Board's deliberations, meetings would be held in public to foster an open and transparent process and to ensure maximum participation. In addition, the meetings would be webcast. He welcomed the Members, staff, and public to the inaugural meeting. Mr. Congdon was introduced to the Members as the Executive Director and Ms. Cartwright was introduced as the Deputy Director of the Energy Planning Board.

Mr. DeCotis said that the agenda items for the organizational meeting include a discussion of: the contents of Executive Order No. 2 ("Executive Order"), an overview of the planning process, and the logistics and the schedule for developing the State Energy Plan. Included with the meeting agenda was a copy of the Executive Order and a related press release announcing the creation of the Energy Planning Board and its purpose.

The Energy Planning Board is expected to hold 3-4 meetings, which will be open to the public, over the course of the next 12 months. Minutes of the meetings will be taken and made available to the public after review and approval.

It is anticipated that a Working Group will be formed to act as staff for the Energy Planning Board. The Working Group will consist of representatives from each of the involved agencies. The Working Group will interact with the public, receive, and review white papers from the various participants, both public and private, and be involved in more in-depth, substantive analysis. Mr. Congdon will Chair the group and coordinate its

activities. Also joining the Working Group will be representatives from the Long Island Power Authority and the New York Power Authority. The Working Group is expected to meet frequently, about once a month, in the initial planning stages, and then bi-weekly as the process moves close to finalizing a draft State Energy Plan. The vast majority of the work will occur within the involved agencies. It will be the responsibility of the Board Members and the Working Group to ensure that involved agency staff remain engaged and committed so that the Energy Planning Board will meet its deadlines.

Historically, energy planning has been important to the State -- New York was the first state in the nation to develop a statewide energy plan and that plan has been used as a model for energy planning by other states. In the past, the process was undertaken every four years and included a comprehensive look at all energy sectors. The previous planning board included five agency chief executives and was established pursuant to Article 6 of the Energy Law, which expired in 2002. As a result, there has been no new energy plan since 2002.

Under the new Executive Order, an Energy Planning Board has been reconvened and expanded to include eleven agency executives who will bring a broad spectrum of expertise and interests. Mr. DeCotis encouraged the Board Members to visit the NYSERDA website, or the Public Service Commission's website, and read the 2002 Plan to get a sense of the comprehensive nature of an energy plan.

Mr. DeCotis then gave a general content overview of the 2002 Plan and discussed the level of stakeholder involvement. He explained that the uses of the State Energy Plan are diverse and important. State agencies will use it to coordinate efforts and as a basis for taking action and will consider the Plan's recommendations in related regulatory proceedings. Primary private sector users will be the energy industry which considers the recommendations of the Plan in making business decisions.

Mr. DeCotis then asked Mr. Congdon to describe the key elements of the Executive Order. Mr. Congdon began by explaining that the schedule for the first

planning process is abbreviated and some issues will necessarily require further study. The Executive Order calls for the development of a very comprehensive State Energy Plan to address 15 key elements. Fundamentally, the State Energy Plan is a statement of long-range energy policy, objectives, and strategies to increase energy supply and reduce energy demand, but it also will include recommendations for administrative and legislative actions to implement those policies, objectives, and strategies. The Executive Order requires that the following analyses be included: demand forecasts for periods up to 10 years for electricity, natural gas, coal and petroleum products and projections of energy prices over the forecast period; supply requirements for the State which are needed to satisfy forecasted demand for electricity, natural gas, coal, and petroleum products; assessments of alternatives to traditional energy resources which are reasonably available for satisfying energy supply requirements; assessments of the impacts associated with electricity production and energy use on public health and the environment, including on communities that are burdened disproportionately by health and environmental impacts; assessments of State environmental policies and programs which impact the State's development and implementation of energy policy and programs; an inventory of greenhouse gas emissions, and strategies for facilitating and accelerating the use of low carbon energy sources and/or carbon mitigation measures; assessments of the costs, benefits, and uncertainties of traditional and alternative transportation measures required to meet system demands over the forecast periods; a comparison of energy prices for various customer classes provided by electric and natural gas utilities of the State with those in other states that compete with New York for business; the role of environmental justice considerations in energy-related decisions; and recommendations for the study of additional issues and/or for further study of issues addressed in the State Energy Plan.

In response to an inquiry, Mr. Congdon concluded his presentation by stating that part of the initial planning will be to determine what can be delivered in the time allotted by the schedule.

Mr. DeCotis explained that the next item on the agenda was to consider the logistics of developing the State Energy Plan and including public outreach and participation. The Working Group will prepare working papers for the Energy Planning Board and will be charged with developing the draft State Energy Plan. The Energy Planning Board will provide input on policy, substance, and analysis. Throughout the planning process, the public will be free to submit comments and white papers on their ideas about the State Energy Plan. This aspect of the process will be open, interactive, and engaging. Public comments will be received by mail or by email and may be summarized and/or disseminated in whole or in part to the Board by the Working Group.

At Mr. DeCotis's request, Mr. Congdon explained that the Working Group will create a website as soon as possible to facilitate public input; develop a mailing list, using lists from previous planning efforts and other sources, and provide meeting notices and updates to the public from time to time; and develop a working paper for the Energy Planning Board that creates the framework for the planning process. The draft framework will be circulated to the Board Members and will describe the roles and responsibilities of the Board Members and the Working Group; contain an overview of the key elements of the State Energy Plan; describe the schedule for the planning process and future Energy Planning Board meetings; and discuss how existing energy task forces and working groups in State government will be integrated into the planning process.

Mr. Congdon added that the Working Group will also be developing a Draft Scope for the State Energy Plan. Due to the short timeframe of the planning process, the Working Group will be asking for the public to comment on the Draft Scope within 4 weeks of issuance. The Working Group will also meet with stakeholders to solicit input. The goal is to have revised Draft Scope for the State Energy Plan, incorporating public comments as appropriate, available by the July 11, 2008, meeting of the Board. It is important that the Board Members attend this meeting.

Mr. Brown expressed concern that there would be more issues than time. Mr. Congdon replied that it is important to remember that the intent is to have a 3-year

planning cycle, including updates, and that some issues may have to be studied as part of updates. Mr. DeCotis added that he did not envision that there would be an “end” to the planning process, but instead there would be continuing coordination over the long-term.

Mr. Congdon then explained that following the Board’s approval of the Scope, the Working Group will assign Working Group members to take the lead in developing each deliverable.

Mr. DeCotis then introduced the next item on the agenda, a schedule for developing the State Energy Plan and for future Energy Planning Board meetings. Mr. Congdon explained that the key milestones are to develop a working paper describing the framework that will be used to guide the process within the next 10 days; develop a Draft Scope to clearly define the deliverables that will make up the State Energy Plan by July 11, 2008; and to prepare a draft State Energy Plan to be issued by March 31, 2009.

Following the issuance of the draft State Energy Plan, there will be at least 6 public meetings during April and May 2009 in different regions across the State, with a final State Energy Plan to be completed by June 30, 2009. Mr. DeCotis said that the schedule presented an enormous challenge.

Mr. Brown commented that all meetings should have well-defined agendas. This would ensure maximum effectiveness; the Board Members would understand the issues to be discussed and could arrange to be accompanied by appropriate staff.

The final item on the agenda was to consider such other business as may come before the Energy Planning Board. Mr. DeCotis asked if there was any other business. There being none, the meeting was adjourned.

Jacqueline L. Jerry, Acting Secretary