

**MINUTES OF THE  
NEW YORK STATE ENERGY PLANNING BOARD MEETING  
HELD ON DECEMBER 18, 2017**

Pursuant to notice dated December 11, 2017, the twelfth meeting of the New York State Energy Planning Board (“Board”) was convened on December 18, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. at the Albany office of the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority, 17 Columbia Circle, Albany, New York. A copy of the meeting Notice is annexed as Exhibit A.

The following Energy Planning Board Members or their designees were present:

- Alicia Barton, President and CEO of the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority and Chair of the Board
- John B. Rhodes, Chair of the NYS Public Service Commission (Peter McGowan, Designee)
- Basil Segos, Commissioner of the NYS Department of Environmental Conservation (Jared Snyder, Designee)
- Howard Zemsky, Chairman and CEO of Empire State Development (Erin Casullo, Designee)
- Roberta Reardon, Commissioner of the NYS Department of Labor
- Roger Parrino, Commissioner of the Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Services (Brian Wright, Designee)
- Dr. Howard Zucker, Commissioner of the NYS Department of Health (Elizabeth Lewis-Michl, Designee)
- Rossana Rosado, Secretary of State (Erin Hogan, Designee)
- Paul Karas, Acting Commissioner of the NYS Department of Transportation
- Richard A. Ball, Commissioner of the NYS Department of Agriculture & Markets (Kevin King, Designee)
- James Winebrake, Appointee of the Governor
- Bradley Jones, President and CEO of the New York Independent System Operator

**Introductory Remarks**

Alicia Barton, President and CEO of the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority, and Chair of the Energy Planning Board welcomed everyone to the twelfth meeting of the New York State Energy Planning Board and noted the presence of a quorum.

Chair Barton provided an overview of the items to be discussed pursuant to the Agenda, primarily the Biennial Report to the *2015 State Energy Plan*, as required by the New York State Energy Law. She described the Biennial Report as outlining a great deal of activity advancing the policies and programs identified in the *2015 State Energy Plan*.

In her remarks, Chair Barton stated that Governor Cuomo's Reforming the Energy Vision (REV) strategy has transitioned from concept into an implementation phase and significant progress in regulatory reforms and market dynamics envisioned through REV has been realized. REV is envisioned to further embed affordability, resilience and beneficial environmental outcomes into the State's energy systems. She added that the State is making advances in policies and programs that contribute to the clean energy goals launched with the *2015 State Energy Plan*, namely, the goals of a 40% greenhouse gas emissions reduction, procuring 50% of the State's electricity needs from renewable energy, and realizing 600 trillion British thermal units (Tbtu) of energy efficiency, which is the equivalent of 23% of all energy needs for the State's building sector, all by 2030. She also mentioned the Clean Energy Standard (CES) as one highlight of the State's overall efforts to combat climate change.

Chair Barton stated that one aspect of her work that she most enjoys is the opportunity to visit many different communities throughout the State, and to see how they are addressing their local energy and environmental issues. She stated that these communities serve as the front line in the State's fight against climate change. They look to the State Energy Planning Board for policy guidance, direction, and assistance in helping them realize their clean energy goals, and the Board looks to them to support the State's advancement of its energy policy goals. In addition, Chair Barton also acknowledged the recently issued *Clean Energy Industry Report*, finding that New York currently supports approximately 150,000 jobs in clean energy sectors.

#### **Acknowledgement of Minutes of June 25, 2015 Meeting (Agenda Item No. 1)**

The first item on the Agenda was to advance the minutes from the Board meeting held on June 25, 2015. It was acknowledged that, as these minutes reflect a meeting that was held some time ago, and in consideration that most of the Board Members present at this meeting were not in attendance at the June 2015 meeting, no official action would be sought to approve the June 25, 2015 minutes. However, the minutes were reconciled with the video that is available on the Energy Planning Board website, and the minutes will be posted on the website to maintain a full record of the proceedings.

Having been present at the June 25, 2015 meeting, Mr. Snyder and Mr. Winebrake confirmed that the meeting activity of that date is consistent with the minutes as drafted. With that, Chair Barton stated that the meeting minutes would be posted on the Planning Board website.

#### **Resolution Regarding the Issuance of the Final State Energy Plan (Agenda Item No. 2)**

John Williams, Director of Policy and Regulatory Affairs, NYSERDA, presented the proposed Biennial Update for the *2015 New York State Energy Plan*. Mr. Williams reviewed the statutory requirements and guidance regarding the Biennial Update development process and stated that this is the first Update under the current statute.

The process included the convening of the State Energy Coordinating Working Group (ECWG), comprised of the State Energy Planning Board agency staffs as well as the Power Authority of the State of New York and the Long Island Power Authority, involved in the development of the State Energy Plan. Mr. Williams explained that the ECWG agreed upon on the general parameters of the document, undertook a comprehensive compilation of all recommendations and highlighted initiatives included in the *2015 State Energy Plan*, and identified additional initiatives.

Mr. Williams then described the structure of the Biennial Report document, which includes a progress synopsis and an initiative tracker by category. Mr. Williams noted that, within each category, one initiative is highlighted in detail to demonstrate how it is working for New Yorkers. The Biennial Report also sets the stage for the upcoming planning cycle by identifying the following four areas of current progress and future direction:

- (1) Energy Efficiency principles;
- (2) Low-to-Moderate Income Clean Energy Initiatives;
- (3) Climate Policy; and
- (4) Clean Energy Industry Report results.

Mr. Williams reported that, of the 43 initiatives introduced in 2015, 3 are complete, 39 are in progress and only one is in the launched stage. In addition, the ECWG identified 22 additional initiatives that are underway in the areas of renewable energy, buildings and energy efficiency, sustainable and resilient communities and energy infrastructure modernization. Mr. Williams provided detailed highlights of initiatives underway for Offshore Wind development, the New York Green Bank, Climate Smart Communities, and ChargeNY.

Mr. Williams provided updated information regarding the New York Greenhouse Gas Inventory, an update of which is to be published shortly. He stated that, to meet the State's climate goals, New York State energy transitions will need to include:

- energy efficiency and conservation in all sectors;
- “decarbonized,” or zero- and low-carbon electricity; and
- fuel-switching that replaces fossil fuel-based energy sources with electricity and lower-emitting biofuels.

Sectors that hold promise for further opportunity in meeting the State's goals were identified as: buildings, transportation, industry, electricity generation, and non-combustion greenhouse gases.

In thanking Mr. Williams for his presentation, Chair Barton recognized the Biennial Report as a

considerable piece of work that required the determination from staff across all implementing agencies to successfully advance these initiatives. She also recognized the energy stakeholders as key partners in advancing and achieving the State's goals.

Mr. Snyder, Designee, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, highlighted the accomplishments and benefits of the nine-state Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI). The RGGI effort has leveraged over \$1 billion in key strategies that have resulted in substantive public health benefits. In stating that the nine-member states have subsequently agreed to further reduce the emissions cap to 30 percent by 2030, he reminded everyone that this will represent a 65 percent reduction in carbon dioxide emissions since 2005. Mr. Snyder also noted that methane is the second greatest source of greenhouse gas emissions, behind carbon dioxide, and that Governor Cuomo's Methane Reduction Plan includes 25 points to drive methane reductions across landfills, oil and gas, and agriculture. He concluded by noting that New York's work in the Transportation and Climate Initiative (TCI) is helping the State to consider additional policies that will drive down emissions from the transportation sector. He shared that last month, New York, along with seven other TCI members—six states and the District of Columbia—announced a process beginning in 2018 to solicit feedback on how this group can establish new regional programs to achieve similar benefits similar to those realized through RGGI.

Chair Barton thanked Mr. Snyder for highlighting how the New York State Energy Plan serves as a guiding platform for a plethora of important and successful energy and environmental efforts.

Mr. Winebrake, Governor's Representative, stated that the Biennial Update was exceptional, easy to comprehend, and a means of tracking progress. He provided some suggestions on ways to potentially improve the presentation of progress tracking, such as additional prioritization and expanding the information on initiative status. Chair Barton thanked Mr. Winebrake for his suggestions, stating that this will be valuable in developing the next State Energy Plan.

Chair Barton then called for consideration of Resolution No. 8, to adopt the Biennial Update of the *2015 New York State Energy Plan*. Whereafter, upon motion duly made and seconded, and by unanimous voice vote, the Board approved the resolution to adopt the Biennial Update of the *2015 New York State Energy Plan*.

### **Other Business**

Chair Barton stated that the approved Biennial Report will be made publicly available on the Energy Plan website at: [www.energyplan.ny.gov](http://www.energyplan.ny.gov).

Chair Barton also stated that the Energy Planning Board is required to issue an energy plan every four years, making the due date for the issuance of the next State Energy Plan in 2019. As such, Mr. Williams presented a high-level view of the required milestones for the forthcoming State energy planning process. Ms. Barton requested that respective agency staff work toward developing a schedule to initiate the work needed, with the expectation of reconvening the Energy Planning Board to discuss that process after the new year. Ms. Barton thanked the Board members and agency staff in advance for their partnership in developing the next State Energy Plan.

There being no other business, upon motion duly made and seconded, the meeting was adjourned.

*Valerie A. Milonovich*

---

Valerie S. Milonovich, Secretary to the Board  
Senior Counsel, NYSERDA

**EXHIBIT A.**

**NEW YORK STATE ENERGY PLANNING BOARD**

17 Columbia Circle Albany, New York 12203

tele · (518) 862-1090

fax · (518) 862-1091

December 11, 2017

December 11, 2017

**NOTICE AND AGENDA**

**TO THE MEMBERS OF THE NEW YORK STATE ENERGY PLANNING BOARD:**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that a meeting of the New York State Energy Planning Board will be held at the Albany office of the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority, 17 Columbia Circle, Albany, New York, on Monday, December 18, 2017, commencing at 1:00 p.m., for the following purposes:

1. To consider and act upon the draft minutes from the June 25, 2015 meeting.
2. To consider and act upon a resolution to issue the Biennial Report for the 2015 State Energy Plan.
3. To transact such other business as may properly come before the Board.

Members of the public may attend the meeting.

NYSERDA will be posting a video of the Board meeting to the State Energy Plan website (<http://www.nysenergyplan.com>) within two business days of the meeting.

Alicia Barton  
Chair